

This letter has now been published here: https://docs.google.com/document/u/1/d/e/2PACX-1vSxEIf0j1H6v3R4549yxfetSBy1ioc6VHyJa3vKfvgyVFX9TAluk_1laTuSBKAyzqjF3hJT9EVw0P7a/pub. Please follow this link to read and share the letter.

October 30, 2023

An Open Letter from Columbia University and Barnard College Faculty in Defense of Robust Debate About the History and Meaning of the War in Israel/Gaza:

The most recent devastating violence in Israel and Gaza that began on October 7, 2023 has had very disturbing reverberations on our campus – for all of us, students, faculty, staff, and the larger Columbia community. We write now to express grave concerns about how some of our students are being viciously targeted with doxing, public shaming, surveillance by members of our community, including other students, and reprisals from employers. These egregious forms of harassment and efforts to chill otherwise protected speech on campus are unacceptable, and we implore every person in the Columbia University community - faculty, administrators, students, alums, public safety - to do more to protect all of our students while preserving Columbia University as a beacon for “fostering critical thinking and opening minds to different points of view,” as President Shafik wrote to the community in her October 18th message about upholding our collective values.

As scholars who are committed to robust inquiry about the most challenging matters of our time, we feel compelled to respond to those who label our students anti-Semitic if they express empathy for the lives and dignity of Palestinians, and/or if they signed on to a [student-written statement](#) that situated the military action begun on October 7th within the larger context of the occupation of Palestine by Israel. We have read that statement carefully, and it is worth pointing out that the arguments it makes echo those made by both governmental and non-governmental agencies and institutions at the highest level for a number of years.

The student statement begins with language that should satisfy any measure of decency: “The loss of a human life is a deeply painful and heartbreaking experience for loved ones, regardless of one’s affiliation. We extend our heartfelt condolences to the individuals and communities at Columbia University affected by the tragic losses experienced by both Palestinians and Israelis.” The statement then turns to the claim that peace and safety for all the peoples of Israel and Palestine will remain elusive unless and until the illegal Israeli occupation of Palestinian territory ends and accountability for that illegal occupation is achieved. This is not a radical or essentially controversial position – indeed, it is the position taken by many committees of the United Nations, the UN General Assembly, and respected human rights organizations. The statement also describes the Israeli treatment of Palestinians as a form of “apartheid”, and while this term is viewed as controversial in some quarters, major human rights organizations such as [Amnesty International](#) and [Human Rights Watch](#) have concluded that the occupation of Palestine and the treatment of Palestinians within Israel amount to a form of apartheid, a crime against humanity with definitions provided in the 1973 International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid (“Apartheid Convention”) and the 1998 Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (ICC). Indeed, Desmond Tutu, noted South African civil rights leader who was the first Black archbishop of Cape Town, [concluded in 2014](#) that: “[Palestinians’] humiliation is familiar to all black South Africans who were

corralled and harassed and insulted and assaulted by the security forces of the apartheid government.” And President Jimmy Carter has [expressed the view](#) that Israel's treatment of Palestinians "perpetrates even worse instances of apartness, or apartheid, than we witnessed even in South Africa."

In our view, the student statement aims to recontextualize the events of October 7, 2023, pointing out that military operations and state violence did not begin that day, but rather it represented a military response by a people who had endured crushing and unrelenting state violence from an occupying power over many years. One could regard the events of October 7th as just one salvo in an ongoing war between an occupying state and the people it occupies, or as an occupied people exercising a right to resist violent and illegal occupation, something anticipated by international humanitarian law in the [Second Geneva Protocol](#). In either case armed resistance by an occupied people must conform to the laws of war, which include a prohibition against the intentional targeting of civilians. The statement reflects and endorses this legal framework, including a condemnation of the killing of civilians.

The statement concludes with a demand that Columbia University reverse a decision to create curricular and research programs in Israel, a demand also made by over 100 Columbia faculty last year, and that the university cease issuing statements that favor the suffering and death of Israelis or Jews over the suffering and death of Palestinians, and/or that fail to recognize how challenging this time has been for all students, not just some.

It is worth noting that not all of us agree with every one of the claims made in the students' statement, but we do agree that making such claims cannot and should not be considered anti-Semitic. Their merits are being debated by governmental and non-governmental agencies at the highest level, and constitute a terrain of completely legitimate political and legal debate.

We are appalled that trucks broadcasting students' names and images are circling the campus, identifying them individually as "Columbia's Leading Anti-Semites", and that some students have had offers of employment withdrawn by employers that sought to punish them for signing the student statement, or for being merely affiliated with student groups associated with the statement. In the absence of university action, students and faculty have undertaken the burden of blocking the images and identifying information broadcast on the doxing trucks. It is worth noting that most of the students targeted by this doxing campaign are Arab, Muslim, Palestinian, or South Asian.

One of the core responsibilities of a world-class university is to interrogate the underlying facts of both settled propositions and those that are ardently disputed. As faculty we are committed to the project of holding discomfort and working across difference with our students. These core academic values and purposes are profoundly undermined when our students are vilified for voicing perspectives that, while legitimately debated in other institutional settings, expose them to severe forms of harassment and intimidation at Columbia.

We ask Columbia University's leadership, our faculty colleagues, Columbia alumni, potential employers of Columbia students, and all who share a commitment to the notion of a just society to join us in condemning, in the strongest of terms, the vicious targeting of our students with doxing, public shaming, surveillance by members of our community, including other students, and reprisals from employers.

Sincerely,

Katherine Franke
James L. Dohr Professor of Law

Rashid Khalidi
Edward Said Professor of Modern Arab Studies

Gray Tuttle

Luce Professor of Modern Tibet, EALAC, Columbia

Jack Halberstam
The David Feinson Professor of the Humanities, Columbia

James Schamus
Professor of Professional Practice, School of the Arts, Columbia

Alexander Alberro
Professor, Department of Art History, Barnard College

Premilla Nadasen
Ann Whitney Olin Professor of History, Barnard College

Ralph Ghoche
Assistant Professor, Architecture, Barnard College

Karen Seeley, Lecturer
Anthropology, Columbia

Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak
University Professor, Columbia

Mae Ngai
Lung Family Professor of Asian American Studies, Professor of History, Columbia

Michael Harris
Professor of Mathematics, Columbia

Marianne Hirsch
William Peterfield Trent Professor Emerita, English and Comparative Literature, Institute for the Study of Sexuality and Gender, Columbia

Mahmood Mamdani
Herbert Lehman Professor of Government, Columbia

Neferti Tadiar
Professor, Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies, Barnard College

Bruno Bosteels
Professor, Latin American and Iberian Cultures, Columbia

Nico Baumbach
Associate Professor of Film and Media Studies, School of the Arts, Columbia

Susan Bernofsky
Professor of Writing, Columbia School of the Arts, Columbia

Victoria de Grazia
Moore Collegiate Professor Emerita, Department of History, Columbia

Shelly Silver
Professor, Visual Arts, School of the Arts, Columbia

Frank Guridy
Dr. Kenneth and Kareitha Forde Professor of African American and African Diaspora Studies, Columbia

Zainab Bahrani
Edith Porada Professor Art History and Archaeology, Columbia

Susan S. Witte

Professor, School of Social Work, Columbia

Karen Van Dyck

Kimon A. Doukas Professor of Modern Greek Literature, Columbia

Najam Haider

Professor of Religion, Barnard College

Avinoam Shalem

Riggio Professor, Arts of Islam, Art History and Archaeology, Columbia

Christia Mercer

Gustave M. Berne Professor of Philosophy, Columbia

Catherine Fennell

Associate Professor, Anthropology, Columbia

Kadambari Baxi

Professor of Professional Practice, Barnard + Columbia Architecture

Reinhold Martin

Professor of Architecture, GSAPP, Columbia

Sheldon Pollock

Raghunathan Professor Emeritus, Arts and Sciences, Columbia

Robert Gooding-Williams

M. Moran Weston/Black Alumni Council Professor of African American Studies and Professor of Philosophy and of African American and African Diaspora Studies, Columbia

Partha Chatterjee

Professor Emeritus of Anthropology and MESAAS, Columbia

Mana Kia

Associate Professor, MESAAS, Columbia

Katharina Pistor

Edwin B. Parker Professor of Comparative Law, Columbia Law School

Martha Howell

Miriam Champion Professor of History, Emerita, Columbia University Arts and Sciences

Elizabeth Hutchinson

Associate Professor of Art History, Barnard College

Madeleine Dobie

Professor of French & Comparative Literature, Columbia

Natasha Lightfoot

Associate Professor, History, Columbia

Brian Boyd

Senior Lecturer in Anthropology & Co-Director of the Center for Palestine Studies, Columbia

David Scott

Department of Anthropology, Columbia

Bette Gordon

Professor, School of the Arts/Film

Lila Abu-Lughod

Anthropology, Columbia

Yannik Thiem
Department of Religion, Columbia

Debbie Becher
Associate Professor, Department of Sociology, Barnard College

Nadia Abu El-Haj
Anthropology, Barnard College

Barbara J. Fields
William R. Shepherd Professor of History, Columbia

Shayoni Mitr
Senior Lecturer, Department of Theatre, Barnard College

Josh Whitford
Associate Professor, Department of Sociology, Columbia

Celia Naylor
Professor, Africana Studies and History Departments, Barnard College

Teresa Sharpe
Senior Lecturer, Sociology, Columbia

Gauri Viswanathan
Class of 1933 Professor of English and Comparative Literature, Columbia

Pablo Piccato
Professor of History, Columbia

Hannah Chazin
Assistant Professor, Anthropology, Columbia

Nara Milanich
Professor, History, Barnard College

Manijeh Moradian
Assistant Professor, WGSS, Barnard College

Adam Reich
Associate Professor, Columbia Sociology

Gregory Mann
Professor, History, Columbia

Mary McLeod
Professor of Architecture, Columbia

Joseph Slaughter
Associate Professor, English and Comparative Literature, Columbia

Jennifer Wenzel
Professor, English & Comparative Literature and MESAAS, Columbia

Lydia H. Liu
Wun Tsun Tam Professor in the Humanities, Columbia

Hiba Bou Akar

Associate Professor, Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation, Columbia

Jean Howard
George Delacorte Professor in the Humanities, Emerita, Columbia

Sarah Haley
Associate Professor of Gender Studies and History, Columbia

Richard Peña
Professor of Film and Media Studies, Columbia

D. Max Moerman
Professor, Asian and Middle Eastern Cultures, Barnard College

Stathis Gourgouris
Professor of Classics, English, Comparative Literature & Society, Columbia

Bruce Robbins
English and Comparative Literature, Columbia

Anupama Rao
History, Barnard College

Anooradha Iyer Siddiqi
Assistant Professor, Architecture, Barnard College

Jonathan Crary
Meyer Schapiro Professor of Modern Art and Theory, Art History, Columbia

Rebecca Jordan-Young
Ann Whitney Olin Professor of Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies, Barnard College

Gregory M. Pflugfelder
Associate Professor of Japanese History, Columbia

Tey Meadow
Associate Professor of Sociology, Columbia

Seth J. Prins
Assistant Professor of Epidemiology and Sociomedical Sciences

Elizabeth Bernstein
Professor and Chair, WGSS and Professor of Sociology, Barnard College

Wael Hallaq
Avalon Foundation Professor in the Humanities, Columbia

Jo Ann Cavallo
Professor and Chair, Italian, Columbia

Zoë Crossland
Professor of Anthropology, Columbia

Paige West
Claire Tow Professor of Anthropology, Barnard College and Columbia University

Gregory Mann
Professor, History, Columbia

Paul Chamberlin
Associate Professor, History, Columbia

Joseph Albernaz
Assistant Professor of English and Comparative Literature, Columbia

Lien-Hang Nguyen
Dorothy Borg Associate Professor, History, Columbia

Marisa Solomon
Assistant Professor, Women's, Gender and Sexuality Studies, Barnard College

Bernard E. Harcourt
Isidor and Seville Sulzbacher Professor, Columbia Law School

Vanessa Agard-Jones
Anthropology, Columbia University

Nina Berman
Professor, Columbia Journalism School

Brent Hayes Edwards
Peng Family Professor of English and Comparative Literature, Columbia

Jafari Sinclair Allen
Professor of African American and African Diaspora Studies, Columbia

Hamid Dabashi
Hagop Kevorkian Professor of Iranian Studies and Comparative Literature, Columbia

Adam Tooze
Kathryn and Shelby Cullom Davis Professor of History, Columbia

Alberto Medina
Professor, LAIC, Columbia

Emanuel Admassu
Assistant Professor, Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation, Columbia

Glenn Mitoma
Lecturer in the Discipline, Institute for the Study of Human Rights, Columbia

Louisa Gilbert
Professor School of Social Work, Columbia

Wayne Proudfoot
Professor Emeritus, Religion, Columbia

David Rosner
Co-Director, Center for the History & Ethics of Public Health, Columbia

Elizabeth A. Povinelli
Franz Boas Professor of Anthropology & Gender Studies, Columbia

Ashraf Ahmed
Associate Professor, Columbia Law School

Jackie Dugard
Senior Lecturer, ISHR, Columbia

Amelia Herbert
Assistant Professor, Education and Urban Studies, Barnard College

Patricia Dailey
Associate Professor of English and Comparative Literature, Columbia

Alex Watson
Lecturer, Barnard College

Mabel O. Wilson
Architecture, GSAPP and Department of African American and African Diaspora Studies, Columbia

Tom Slater
Professor of Urban Planning, Columbia

Kim Phillips-Fein
Professor of History, Columbia

Joseph A. Howley
Associate Professor of Classics and Paul Brooke Program Chair for Literature Humanities,
Columbia

Walter Frisch
Gumm/von Tilzer Professor of Music, Columbia

James Yeh
Adjunct Assistant Professor, School of the Arts, Columbia

Marc Van De Mieroop
Miriam Champion Professor of History, Columbia University Arts and Sciences

Timothy Mitchell
Professor, MESAAS, Columbia

Bahia Munem
Lecturer Center for the Study of Ethnicity and Race (CSER)

Camille Robcis
Professor of French & History, Columbia

Tom Kalin
Professor of Professional Practice, Film Program, Columbia

Hugo Sarmiento
Assistant Professor, Urban Planning GSAPP, Columbia

Claudio Lomnitz
Professor of Anthropology, Columbia

Nina Berman
Professor, Columbia Journalism School

Thea Renda Abu El-Haj
Professor of Education, Barnard College

Harold Stolper
Lecturer, School of International and Public Affairs, Columbia

J. Blake Turner, Ph.D.
Division of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, Department of Psychiatry, Columbia

Helen Benedict
Professor, Columbia Journalism School

Samuel Kelton Roberts
History, Sociomedical Sciences, & AAADS, Columbia

Ayten Gundogdu

Associate Professor of Political Science, Barnard College

Asim Ansari
Professor, Columbia Business School

Katryn Evinson, Ph.D.
Core Lecturer, Columbia

Nina Alvarez
Assistant Professor, Columbia Journalism School

Frederik Deneff
Professor of Physics, Columbia

Kamel Jedidi
Professor of Business, Columbia Business School

Daniel Malinsky, PhD
Assistant Professor, Department of Biostatistics, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia

Sharon Schwartz
Professor of Epidemiology, Columbia

Joseph Massad
Professor, MESAAS, Columbia

A. Kayum Ahmed
Assistant Professor, Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health

Marwa Elshakry
History, Columbia

Marcus Folch
Associate Professor of Classics, Columbia

Victoria Frye
Professor, School of Social Work, Columbia

Kristele Younes
Lecturer in Humanitarian Policy and Practice, Columbia

Joanne Bauer
Adjunct Professor, SIPA, Columbia

Daniel Naujoks
Lecturer in International and Public Affairs, Director, International Organization and UN Studies, School of International and Public Affairs (SIPA), Columbia

Aftab Ahmad
Senior Lecturer, Hindi-Urdu, MESAAS, Columbia

Nora Gross
Assistant Professor of Education, Barnard College

Prantik Saha, MD MPH
Assistant Clinical Professor of Pediatrics, Vagelos College of Physicians & Surgeons, Columbia University
Irving Medical Center

Christine Marrewa
Lecturer in South Asian Studies, Middle Eastern, South Asian, and African Studies, Columbia

Sabrina Hermosilla
Assistant Professor, Heilbrunn Department on Population and Family Health, Columbia

Jeffrey Fagan
Isidor & Seville Sulzbacher Professor of Law, Columbia

Ross Hamilton
Professor of English, Barnard College

Ateya Khorakiwala
Assistant Professor GSAPP Columbia

Homa Zarghamee
Associate Professor and Chair of Economics, Barnard College

Duygu Ula Lecturer
Barnard College

Tim Wyman-McCarthy
Associate in the Discipline, Institute for the Study of Human Rights, Columbia

Meredith Benjamin
Lecturer, Barnard College

Cecelia Lie-Spahn
Associate Director of First-Year Writing and Lecturer in English, Barnard College

Laura Perez
Adjunct Professor, School of International and Public Affairs, Columbia

Joey De Jesus
Associate of English and Comparative Literature, Columbia; Adjunct Lecturer, Barnard College

Daniel Alarcón
Assistant Professor, Columbia Journalism School

Zeynep Celik
Sakip Sabanci Visiting Professor, History

Kim F. Hall
Lucyle Hook Professor of English and Professor of Africana Studies, Barnard College

Elizabeth Leake
Professor, Italian, Columbia

Courtney Cogburn
Associate Professor, School of Social Work, Columbia

Tim Wyman-McCarthy
Associate in the Discipline, Institute for the Study of Human Rights, Columbia

Ruth Mukwana
Adjunct Professor, Columbia

Chazelle Rhoden
Anthropology, Columbia

Audra Simpson
Professor, Department of Anthropology, Columbia

Kendall Thomas
Nash Professor of Law, Columbia

Thanassis Cambanis
Adjunct Professor, Columbia SIPA

Abigail Greenleaf
Assistant Professor, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia

Jon Kessler
Professor of Visual Arts, Columbia

Michael Wessells
Professor Emeritus, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia

Jhumpa Lahiri
Millicent C. McIntosh Professor of English, Director, Creative Writing Program, Affiliated Faculty,
Department of Comparative Literature and Translation Studies and Program in Italian, Senior Fellow, The
Italian Academy for Advanced Studies in America, Columbia University

Isabel Huacuja Alonso
Assistant Professor, Department of Middle Eastern, South Asian & African Studies, Columbia

Laila AbdelSalam
Instructor of Medical Psychology, Columbia University Irving Medical Center

Natalie Adler, Lecturer
University Writing Program, Columbia

Betsy Apple
Adjunct Professor, International Human Rights Law, SIPA, Columbia

Illan Gonen
Lecturer, MESAAS, Columbia

June Cross
Fred W. Friendly Professor of Media and Society, Columbia Journalism School

Brittany Koffer
Core Lecturer, Philosophy Department, Columbia

Nina Sharma
Adjunct Associate Professor, Barnard College English; Adjunct Assistant Professor, Columbia UG writing

Isabel Ortiz
Consultant, Writing Center, Columbia

(list in formation)